

00:13:41 Arshia Cont: I will unfortunately have to leave in 40min for another meeting!

00:14:26 jsawruk: Michael, your screen is cut off

00:14:36 jsawruk: There you go

00:22:19 jsawruk: ot

00:22:22 jsawruk: It's fine now

00:22:41 Michael Scott Cuthbert: Woo hoo! 3.2!

00:28:47 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Are the IP issues enumerated anywhere?

00:29:12 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): OK

00:38:28 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): The sum total of all musicxml ever generated might be about the same about of data as this 40-part video chat today is going to create, so from my perspective, let's keep the data in our encoding!

00:39:05 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): A proposed topic for gathering input (save for later): what is a good forum to discuss digital scores among multiple projects? Specifically, transcribing public domain print scores to digital scores. Should I create such a forum?

00:39:37 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): OK, will bring it back later.

00:40:59 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Does format converter belong on this list? (MusicXML <-> MNX <-> MEI <-> etc.)

00:42:05 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Does music score "diff"/"patch" belong on this list?

00:47:10 jsawruk: XML diff vs. musically-semantic diff

00:47:14 jsawruk: Jim, let's talk offline

00:47:33 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): Minimal music differing is really hard – I've had two different smart Masters Students work on the problem and they're still not solved :-)

00:47:35 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): OK, make "diff"/"patch" a separate discussion. If only we had a forum for such conversations...

00:48:05 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Format converter?

00:49:11 Adrian Holovaty: Jim: I'm going to touch on format conversion in my part of the presentation a bit later

00:50:57 Arshia Cont: We would be interested at format converters (we contribute to LibMusicXml for this). I unfortunately have to leave guys! arshia@antescofo.com

00:53:14 George Litterst: Full, unambiguous documentation of MusicXML is crucial—especially coordinate reference points. It's difficult to imagine moving forward with MusicXML when there are ambiguities in the spec.

00:53:17 Christina Noel: Agreed

00:53:29 Philip Rothman: Hi all. I need to sign off for now. Looking forward to checking out the recording later. The collective brainpower here is making my computer explode. Nice to see all my friends. Stay well. Best wishes from New York.

00:54:53 George Litterst: When MusicXML does not specify coordinate origins, the documentation should be clear on that point.

00:59:16 Daniel Ray: Jumping back in on the Swing issue. Maybe the

solution here is not to apply a numerical value, but an interpretation value from a global list (ex: Samba, Shuffle, etc.) and it would be up the various software solutions on how to apply this.

00:59:32 Daniel Ray: This could be a mast list like SoundID

00:59:42 Daniel Ray: SwingID

00:59:48 bwb: In terms of performance parameters I'd like to point you to the "Music Performance Markup" model for describing performance parameters: <https://github.com/axelberndt/MPM>

01:00:40 bwb: An engine to render "expressive MIDI" is under construction

01:01:06 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Documentation is perfect, no work necessary. :-)

01:01:10 bwb: bwb = Benjamin W. Bohl (Music Encoding Initiative)

01:01:58 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): Glad to volunteer!

01:04:53 Cyri Coutelier (Prague, Flat.io): Is there a place to have official MusicXML examples on specific elements, a bit in the fashion of the current documentation website?

01:05:18 Fabrizio Ferrari: Good question Cyri, I second that!

01:05:21 Christina Noel: Is clarification of the meaning of default y on stems one of the documentation issues?

01:06:02 Christina Noel: Ok

01:06:31 Jason Wick: Thank you, Michael. I have to head out. Talk to you later.

01:07:22 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): Michael, You can make a poll (or make a co-host to make a poll) between 3.2 or 4.0

01:07:35 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): within Zoom!

01:07:57 Daniel Ray: What about a quicker release for 3.2 for issues easier to get out (before next year) and then 4.0 for much more significant improvements.

01:08:18 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): 4.0!

01:08:18 Daniel Ray: Septmeberish

01:08:22 Kenzi NOIKE: 3.2

01:08:30 Dominik Hörmel: 3.2

01:08:35 jsawruk: 4.0

01:08:40 Daniel Ray: Octoberish? :)

01:08:43 bwb: Concerning version numbers I'd say it depends on the changes

01:08:58 bwb: I'd suggest going with semantic versioning:  
[semver.org](http://semver.org)

01:09:05 Eric Carraway: Are the differences between 3.1 and the current version considered "major", "minor", or more of a patch? (Could we use Server guidelines?)

01:12:12 Christina Noel: Why not do it by show of hands?

01:12:41 Christina Noel: Either way.

01:13:31 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): Discussion  
Question: Is anyone else interested in continuing and developing the Lilypond MusicXML test suite? I have a fork I worked on 4 years ago at: <https://github.com/cuthbertLab/musicxmlTestSuite>

01:17:56 James Sutton: Thanks for bringing back the SVG Daniel

01:18:00 Fabrizio Ferrari: Nice cat Dan ;)

01:22:56 Jeff Kellem: Agree, fonts designed for use in text versus UI elements tend to have different specs and constraints. But, it may be worth specifying guidelines.

01:25:36 Benjamin Spratling: Apologies for being late, I got the time zones confused. I have a technical question about MusicXML  
<direction-type><rehearsal>

Finale is exporting all section names, like "Verse" or "Bridge" as these <direction-type><rehearsal> elements, while Sibelius only sends letters or numbers, such as "A" or measure numbers, like "29" and sends section names as pure text.

My app only obtains content by importing MusicXML files, and it has a very strong need to know section names if the user has explicitly specified them, in fact the ability to specify section names with the <direction-type><rehearsal> was one of the key reasons I picked MusicXML.

Which app is using the rehearsal element as intended?

If it is Sibelius, can we add a feature for marking user-specified section names which are names instead of merely letters?

01:26:13 Adrian Holovaty: <https://w3c.github.io/mnx/by-example/>

01:27:48 Fabrizio Ferrari: That's just fantastic. I have been waiting for this in a long time! Thanks guys :)

01:27:54 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Would it be useful to add an MEI column to these examples?

01:28:03 Michael Good: Hi Ben – Great topic. We're on to MNX now so could you please raise this as an issue in the MusicXML GitHub repository? Thanks!

01:28:51 bwb: > Would it be useful to add an MEI column to these examples?

01:29:12 Christina Noel: Re MEI: I think so. But are there IP issues adding MEI to our site?

01:29:17 bwb: Probably a good idea, as MEI has done some work to ease the lively exchange between MEI and MNX

01:30:39 Laurent Pugin: > But are there IP issues adding MEI to our site?

01:30:44 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): I certainly hope that W3C project and MEI group can remove IP barriers to collaboration.

01:30:48 Jeff Kellem: The example side is useful.

01:30:51 Laurent Pugin: No, I don't think they would be any IP issue

01:31:33 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): The problem is too hard, and the benefit of working together too great, to let such barriers get in the way.

01:31:56 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): is there a problem with another person making such a MNX/MEI concordance based on MNX by example?

01:32:14 Michael Good: Not from the MNX side!

01:32:15 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): MEI != "every other format"

01:32:25 James Ingram: How far can we trust the draft spec? We need

more examples e.g. with different barline types

01:33:23 bwb: Re: MEI

01:33:25 bwb: The Music Encoding Initiative (MEI) sees the need to better connect with the MNX community. Thus we did some work to support this. Namely providing a MEI Basic customization that fits the current development satatus of MNX and providing a converter for MNX to MEI.

customization in ODD (XML meta-schema format by the Text Encoding Initiative)

<https://github.com/music-encoding/music-encoding/tree/develop/customizations>

<https://github.com/music-encoding/music-encoding/blob/develop/customizations/mei-basic.xml>

RNG schema file

<https://github.com/music-encoding/music-encoding/blob/develop/schemata/mei-basic.rng>

Converter for MNX to MEI

<https://github.com/music-encoding/encoding-tools>

<https://github.com/music-encoding/encoding-tools/tree/master/mnx2mei>

01:34:22 bwb: I already love MNX-Common by example ;-)

01:35:25 jsawruk: What language(s) are mnxcoverter written in?

01:35:37 Benjamin Spratling: Would you release converters in a language which can be run everywhere? For instance I wouldn't be able to run python on ios.

01:35:40 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Does mnxconvertor convert in both directions?

01:35:58 jsawruk: Oh Python. Great

01:37:21 Benjamin Spratling: Perhaps javascript, although I recognize that's a terrible developer experience, it's something that can execute on any platform. C++, also a terrible dev process, but it can run everywhere.

01:38:06 Peter Jonas (shoogle): Why not XSLT? That is independent of language.

01:38:06 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): If you're working with Python and MusicXML, please feel free to use music21 in the conversion project; I think you'll save some time with that.

01:38:20 Benjamin Spratling: it runs on iOS?

01:38:28 Benjamin Spratling: so not every operating system

01:38:38 Benjamin Spratling: no command line tools allowed on iOS

01:38:57 Markus Hüenthal: does it run using python 2 or

python 3?

01:39:07 Daniel Spreadbury: It's python 3.7

01:39:16 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): @Benjamin Spratling, do you want to do score conversion on your iOS device? What about putting the conversion service on a website, and having iOS device use that website for conversion?

01:39:48 Michael Good: I was just going to suggest what Jim

mentioned.

01:41:33 Benjamin Spratling: Jim, that's an option, but my user base often works in low-network-connectivity areas.

01:42:02 Benjamin Spratling: Also, with no other features that use a backend server, that would add a high barrier to entry for me

01:42:13 Daniel Spreadbury: It's open source, Benjamin, so you are free to use the code as inspiration for an implementation in Obj-C/Swift

01:42:22 Daniel Spreadbury: Or indeed any other language

01:42:30 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Does mnxcoveter have some sort of pivot abstraction? How hard would it be to add an MEI support module to it? (Jim "encouraging collaboration between projects" DLH)

01:42:41 James Ingram: Is there a Problem in thatthe MusicXMLis the Breaking MusicXML,so you Need to develop the Breaking MusicXML at the same time

01:44:28 Daniel Spreadbury: We're not proposing any changes that break MusicXML

01:44:36 Daniel Spreadbury: MusicXML 3.2/4.0 would be non-breaking changes

01:44:42 Daniel Spreadbury: Backwards compatibility would be retained

01:45:49 James Ingram: There are currenly two different "latest MusicXML" versions. The Breaking MusicXML that isconvertible to MNX, and then there's MusicXML 4.0.

01:46:55 Daniel Spreadbury: I'm not sure what you mean by "Breaking MusicXML" but perhaps it doesn't matter. This tool is for MusicXML 3.1 at present.

01:47:22 Laurent Pugin: Do you have a direct mapping between classes and MNX elements?

01:49:02 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Contributing to this might be a great learning exercise for me. Do I wait until the project is published as a W3C repo?

01:49:55 James Ingram: I have a direct mapping between classes and MNX Elements -- in C#

01:51:27 Daniel Ray: And it is the only language named after a snake! I mean... who would win in a fight against a bear? Python r XSLT?

01:52:22 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): Isn't ASP named after a snake?

01:52:33 Matt Briggs: Is it conceivable that reflection could be used on the classes to generate xsd? Or put differently, what is the path to xsd so that other programming languages can generate data structures?

01:53:01 jsawruk: Python is named after Monty Python

01:54:48 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): In seriousness, I really like the notion of developing a new format in the context of converting existing format(s) – it ensures that tool builders have an easy path towards supporting new tools. It reminds me of Michael G.'s original justification for MusicXML needing to have at least one market leader on board. This is the same thing – it will have a notation-interchange market leader on board.

01:56:06 Matt Briggs: So xsd is not planned for mnx?

01:56:48 bwb: Why not use ODD it can compile to both and others more

01:56:56 bwb: XSD, RNG, ...

01:59:38 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Can rename the tool to not include the format name. Just call the tool after a character in music, e.g. "Loge" the shape-shifter?

02:01:14 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): I'm with Christina, I'm strongly against changing the name.

02:01:44 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): +1 Christina. Instead, sever the connection between tool name and format name.

02:01:48 James Ingram: There will probably be many different Formats supporting the world's Music notations. I think we Need a more generic naming concept. I'dgo for something more like the mp3, mp4 scheme. Why not mn1, mn2, mn3 etc.?

02:01:53 Peter Jonas (shoogle): I'm in favour of this change. People will abbreviate to MNX anyway and that will cause confusion.

02:02:47 jsawruk: How about only renaming "MNX-Common" to MNX and keep "MNX-Generic" as is?

02:04:03 James Sutton: There is nothing in common between these 2 standards now

02:04:09 Peter Jonas (shoogle): But we still haven't done any real work on Generic at this point, so why not rename it?

02:04:11 Benjamin Spratling: At a minimum, build it as a library, and then if you want a command-line app, build a light-weight command-line app wrapper the takes the library as a dependency. GIT made the mistake of doing everything as a command-line app early on, and that inhibited the growth of things like GitHub where they had to re-write it all from scratch.

02:04:22 James Sutton: It is confusing to call them both MNX

02:04:53 Peter Jonas (shoogle): Fact is the Generic format will look nothing like the Common format.

02:06:09 Michael Cuthbert (music21/Artusi): Thanks everyone, especially Adrian, Daniel, and Michael. – I need to run to prepare my class. One good thing that's coming out of Covid is that a lot of my lectures are going on-line so if anyone wants to learn (python-based) computational music analysis there's a playlist at : <https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLv4kQwYTC3DQjsd4DsUW1MKyX4TKzLLhD> – take care. THANKS!

02:07:32 Matt Briggs: Regarding the MNX/MGX name change, my vote is 'Ship it'. I think it is confusing to have different file formats share a name, I was concerned by that from the beginning.

02:08:39 Dominik Hörmel: I like the example-driven procedure. Will the spec be tightened on this way?

02:09:52 Peter Jonas (shoogle): MIDI is overreaching what it was originally intended for.

02:10:27 Peter Jonas (shoogle): I think Daniel suggested MIDI is a native format. It is not.

02:12:14 James Sutton: nothing wrong with midi adopting mnx for notation

02:13:32 jsawruk: There is still a LOT of paper  
02:13:35 Benjamin Spratling: Are there open source  
implementations of MusicXML rendering that can render everywhere?  
Such as in javascript using HTML? or code that produces SVG? I've  
seen some attempts from 3-7 years ago, but nothing looks actively  
maintained.  
02:13:50 Fabrizio Ferrari: Paper/digital what's the difference?  
02:13:57 Benjamin Spratling: thanks  
02:14:10 bwb: Verovio  
02:14:31 Jim DeLaHunt (Vancouver, Canada): Previous question about  
forums.  
02:15:52 Benjamin Spratling: Thanks for doing this online, would  
have been unable to attend if in-person. Been eating/sleeping  
MusicXML for 3 years.  
02:17:30 Peter Jonas (shoogle): @Jim, create an issue on MNX GitHub  
to gauge interest.  
02:17:36 Christina Noel: Then we all get invites and participate.  
02:19:34 Daniel Spreadbury: Thanks Benjamin!  
02:19:42 Jeff Kellem: Jim DeLaHunt: probably not the right spot,  
one place that comes to mind for music notation forums is notat.io ...  
02:19:54 Benjamin W. Bohl: MEI and MNX  
02:19:55 Benjamin W. Bohl: RNG schema file  
[https://github.com/music-encoding/music-encoding/blob/develop/  
schemata/mei-basic.rng](https://github.com/music-encoding/music-encoding/blob/develop/schemata/mei-basic.rng)

Converter for MNX to MEI  
<https://github.com/music-encoding/encoding-tools>  
<https://github.com/music-encoding/encoding-tools/tree/master/mnx2mei>  
02:20:53 Markus Hübenthal: thanks also to Daniel s. for adding  
so nice cat content to the discussion!  
02:21:01 Daniel Spreadbury: Sorry about my cat :)  
02:21:02 Fabrizio Ferrari: agreed!  
02:21:14 Daniel Spreadbury: She's been a feature of every  
meeting I've done for the past 6 weeks  
02:21:15 Fabrizio Ferrari: Love him/her ;)  
02:21:41 Dominik Hörmel: Thanks for organizing the meeting!  
02:21:41 Jeff Kellem: Cats always make the meetings better. ;)